

Does the Recent Publication on 'Jirum' contain 'Secret Knowledge' Hidden even from Masani and Chiniwalla Brothers?

(Dini Avaz July-August 1997 Vol 2; No.4)

Recently a large book is published under the auspices of the so-termed "Mazdayasnie Monasterie" by the "general editor" Mrs. Meher Master Moos. The book has as its title "COSMOGENESIS - BEHRAMSHAH SHROFF ON VARNA JZHIRUM". In the preface and the two introductory articles following it, Mrs. Master-Moos has made some statements which have hurt the feelings of a large number of IIm-e-Khshnoomists who are in this line since several years. The feelings are hurt not because of the Gujarati content of the book, which is written with the able hands of Ervad Phiroze Masani in consultation with Baheramshahji, but because of the untrue nature of Mrs. Master-Moos's statements regarding its source. I have been asked to clarify matters and reveal the truth.

The Preface and the two introductory articles state that the book contains original and hitherto secret writings of the late Baheramshahji. The story as narrated by Mrs. Master Moos can be summarized as follows: Baheramshahji was in public life in Bombay upto 1920. He then went to Surat. There he dictated several topics relating to IIm-e-Khshnoom to his disciple and "amenuensis", the late Mrs. Banoobai K. Modi. He collected these writings in a "secret trunk". He desired that the trunk should not go into the hands of the two Masani brothers and the two Chiniwalla brothers but should be opened and its contents utilized only after the death of both the sets of brothers. This trunk was kept by one (or two?) friend(s) of Baheramshahji and ultimately it landed into the hands of some persons who desire to remain anonymous. Five exercise books from the trunk containing the said dictated writings on the subject of Jirum came into the hands of Mrs. Master-Moos through me. This, according to her, was the beginning of "a new era" and it was left to her to reveal to the Parsi Community that hidden treasure of knowledge **which was not intended by Baheramshahji to go to the hands of even Masani and Chiniwalla brothers.** Mrs. Master-Moos says on page (x) :

"Before his (Baheramshahji's) death this wealth of spiritual knowledge contained in the manuscript books written out by his amanuensis, the late Mrs. Banoobai K. Modi was gathered by him and entrusted to a close friend with the direction that it should be kept safely with him and should not be permitted to come into the hands of the Masani brothers and Chiniwalla brothers It could have been that under the law of BISH PISH **the time was not ripe then** during the past half of this century for this knowledge **to come out.**"

There is a similar statement on page (iv).

Is this true? Does the book contain very much hidden knowledge, which was prohibited even to Masani and Chiniwalla brothers, the foremost disciples of Baheramshahji ?

THIS IS NOT TRUE.

I will tell you here the exact source and stages of this alleged, "hidden manuscripts" and also some of the convincing evidence I have got to falsify the tall claim of Mrs. Moos.

Baheramshahji was in the secret abode of the Zoroastrian Saints during 1875-1878. He did not reveal this to anybody till 1905-1906. He started giving a few glimpses of his Mystic Knowledge at Surat before 3 small study group headed by the late Mr. Manchershah Kekobad, the then Head Master of Mission School. In about 1908, Mr. Kaikhushru Choksi persuaded-Baheramshahji to come to Bombay. Mr. Choksi organized a study class where Baheramshahji spoke on various topics touching the Mystic Side of our Religion. This class was not open to all. It was mainly for Priests and other selected persons. The first ever writings on Ilm-e-Khshnoom were made here.

From this point, the facts can well be taken over by **the following words of the late Dinshah Masani**, one of the Masani brothers, appearing on **page 518 of Baheramshah Shroff Memorial Volume (1930)**:

"The valuable notes of Khshnoom, which Mr. Choksi had written down and collected after taking great toil and trouble, were rewritten by Phiroze Masani and the late Sohrab Panthaki before the respected Ustad Saheb, and **arising out of these notes the following famous lectures were delivered** under the auspices of the same Institute (Ilm-e-Khshnoom Institute):

1. 4 lectures regarding 'Sarosh'
2. **11 lectures on 'Jirum'**
3. 14 lectures on 'Atash-e-vahararan'
4. 2 lectures on 'Meher' or the truth."

Again on page 502 of the Memorial Volume, Mr. Dinshah Masani writes:

"Mr. Choksi continued the class so long as he could and in a very short time a sizable amount of the knowledge relating to Ilm-e-Khshnoom was written out. (If I use the words of my Ustad Saheb, this was snatched away from him.) **Based on these notes, the series of public lectures were written out** as very useful notes in the form of books. **(By the Grace of God I had an opportunity of reading all these notes.)"**

The trunk alleged to contain "the highly secret treasure" has all the above notes of lectures referred to above by the late Dinshah Masani! The lectures were on the 4 topics enumerated by him and you will see that 11 lectures of Jirum constituted one of the four series. Further, Dinshah says he had read all these notes! Top secret ??

The trunk ultimately came to the home of certain relatives of Baheramshahji (who desire to remain anonymous). I (K. N. Dastoor) was called at their home in September 1975 to examine the contents. I found that the trunk had in it the said note books containing the texts of all the lectures on the said 4 topics. **There was no hidden secret about these notes since they were lectures of Baheramshahji delivered in public!**

Of the four topics contained in the four sets of exercise books, the one on Sarosh has already been printed and published in 1915 under the title ‘સરોશ ચજદનું કુદરતની તમામ પેદાયશમાં મહાન કાર્ય’, ‘લખનાર, મી. બહેરામશાહ નવરોજી શરાફ જરથોશ્તી ઇલ્મે ઈનુમના ઉસ્તાદ તથા જરથોશ્તી ઇલ્મે ઈનુમ ઇન્સ્ટીટ્યુટ’ ના માલેક (ઇ. સ. ૧૯૧૫) One of the exercise books from the trunk on the topic of "Sarosh" is the same, 'word-to-word, as in that printed booklet! **And the**

handwritings in the note books on Sarosh are the same as in the note books on Jirum! Top Military Secret ???

The other set of 5 exercise books from the trunk contained 12 lectures on 'Atashe-Vahararan'. These are being reproduced in this humble Journal, Dini Avaz. We are fully aware that these lectures do not constitute any secret intended to be hidden from Masani and Chiniwalla brothers. On pages 645 to 657 of Baheramshah Shroff Memorial Volume (1930), you will see a point-by-point summary of those very lectures which are being published in Dini Avaz. A simple comparison between the summarized points in memorial Volume and the matter already published in Dini Avaz will reveal this without any doubt. Here also, nothing secret, to be worth taking false credit as Mrs. Master-Moos appears to do! Remember! **These lectures are also from the same alleged top secret trunk!**

The third set of the note-books found in the same trunk, was on the subject of Jirum. This is also a part of what Mrs. Master-Moos boasts as having been secretly dictated by Baheramshahji to Mrs. Banubai Modi. In fact, **these lectures were also delivered at 11 public meetings – under the Chairmanship of Mr. Jehangirji Vimadalal. There is no doubt whatsoever that these lectures on Jirum were prepared by Ervad Phiroze Masani from the notes taken in Baheramshahji's class organized by Mr. Choksi. Ervad Phiroze first prepared, out of the rough notes, the points in a logical order. He then sat with Baheramshahji, got every point elaborated and wrote down further extensive rough notes in his presence. He then prepared the final script for the lectures, which were then read out in public.**

The two sets of note books, one on 'Atash' and the other on 'Jirum' were taken out of the trunk in my presence and handed over to me by the said relatives of Baheramshahji in September 1975. They had not come to me through Mr, Hormusji Dalal as stated by Mrs. Master-Moos. It was I who informed her about the note books on Jirum and arranged to have the set delivered to her never imagining that she would use it the way in which she has done!

I have in my possession (i) the original rough points prepared by Ervad Phiroze Masani in his own handwritings; (ii) further rough script prepared by him in his own handwritings in presence of Baheramshahji and (iii) a carbon copy of the report in his handwritings and signed by him, the original of which he sent to news Papers for publishing the reports of the eleven lectures on Jirum.

Comparing these handwritings of Ervad Phiroze with the contents of the allegedly secret notebooks, it is as clear as the sun that these are the said very 11 lectures on Jirum referred to by Dinshah Masani and written out by Phiroze Masani as above. The order of points and sub-topics and the materials are the same as in the fair and final lectures.

The carbon copy of the report for the press prepared by Ervad Phiroze in his handwritings and signed by him (iii above) contains the subject matter **of these very lectures in a highly condensed form and in the same order of sub-topics.** This writing of Ervad Phiroze also contains several pages, which constitute the report of Baheramshah's own words spoken after each lecture was readout. Mrs. Master Moos's book does not have this. Phiroze's said writings also contains the address of Jehangirji Vimadalal delivered from the Presidential Chair.

In the Gujarati Section of the next issue of Dini Avaz I shall reproduce a few extracts from these pages written out by Ervad Phiroze.

But the most amusing part of this foolhardy adventure is that the trunk itself contains several note books in the handwritings of Phiroze and some of them contain exactly the

same material on this very topic of Jirum" as appearing in the final 11 lectures in Mrs. Moos's book!

But you need not even refer to Phiroze's handwritings to prove the falsity of the secret-dictation theory of Mrs. Moos.

If you are used to reading his style in 'Frasho-Gard' magazine, a single Gujarati page of Mrs. Moos's book will make it clear that it is Phiroze's language. I know that this exercise is too much for Mrs. Master-Moos who admittedly is unable to read much in Gujarati. But there is one thing she should have noticed, but seems to have missed it or ignored it, or not followed it, in her over enthusiasm to reveal the alleged "secrets hidden from Masani and Chiniwalla", **There are references in the Gujarati writings, as appearing in her book itself, that these were meant as public lectures and not secret dictations of Baheramshahji.** On the very first page (in Gujarati) the following words appear:

“ જરથેશ્તી દએન શું છે. અને આખી સૃષ્ટિ રચનાના ઇભમની દરેકે દરેક શાખા. બાબે જે મોતેબર શિક્ષણ હાલ કેટલાંક વરસ થયા આપણને આપતા રહયાં છે, તે મારેફત માનવંત ઉસ્તાદ સાહેબોને ઉપકાર માની આજનો વિષય આ ઇન્સ્તીત્યુતના ખુદાના ચીવાથી તમો સનમુખ રખુ કરવાની રજા લઉં છું”

This means that these were lectures sponsored by the Ilm-e-Khshnoom Institute and Ustad Saheb is being thanked for it - please mind - in third person! This is not, therefore, Baheramshahji directly dictating, but it is clear indication that the lectures were prepared through him and under his guidance!

Again on page 4 of the Gujarati part of the book, the study classes and public lectures run under the auspices of that Institute are referred to.

On page 5 it is clearly stated that the subject of Jirum was one step further in the **series of lectures** relating to Khshnoom. I translate a few lines:

"So far because of the grace of Ustad Saheb and by the Will of God, **we have heard the lectures** on Atash Behram, Sarosh, Meher, Ceremonies, Sudreh-Kushti etc. These related to the very elements of Khshnoom (but) the present topic is a step further. Therefore it is essential to request you that please try to understand this subject with greater patience than formerly and as you found it difficult to comprehend previous subjects, if you find this root subject extremely difficulty, please forgive."

Reading Gujarati pages 4, 5, 6 and 7 of the very book, it is entirely clear that these were meant to be public lectures; previous lectures were referred to; their subject matters were referred to; the word “ભાષણો” is written, on pages 4 and 5, nine times! The very style is that of an address to the public. Nothing secret Madame Monastrial !!

Now, a few words about the handwritings in which the note-books on Jirum found in the trunk are written. Mrs. Master-Moos says they are the handwritings of the late Mrs. Banubai Mody. I do not have any material, which would support or contradict this statement. But assuming that they are, the facts that (i) one another note-book on Sarosh found in the same trunk is written in the same handwritings as in the note-books on Jirum and (ii) the content of the former is already printed and published, show that no top secret sanctity is fastened either to those handwritings or to the trunk! It is clear that that hand had **copied out the topics** in fair and not taken down secret dictations.

I feel really sorry that **I have to emphasize Mrs. Master-Moos's inability to "read and understand" Gujarati sufficiently fluently. She herself says so on page (v) of the book!** Now, all the Khshnoom literature (except two solitary books) is written in Gujarati, and this Gujarati is often found difficult to be understood even by scholars of the language. The history of propagation of Khshnoom in the Parsi Anjuman of India is also in Gujarati. That will be found mainly spread over in the volumes of 'Frasho Gard' Journal of Ervad Phiroze Masani and of 'Parsi Avaz' Weekly of Jehangirji Chiniwalla. In particular, Baheramshah Shroff Memorial Volume (1930) and a long series written by Jehangirji in Parsi Avaz under the title ઇતિહાસ ધર્મજી મહત્તમની તવારીખ contain the authentic record of the life of Baheramshahji and the history of propagation of Khshnoom. Mrs. Master-Moos's secret-dictation theory is so much inconsistent with all that happened between 1905 and 1927 that I am sure she has not read these authentic records, and if read, then only casually through somebody or at least not carefully. When one rushes in public, facts must be ascertained with great care, and written with great care. (For instance, Baheramshahji's first teacher during his stay with the Saints was "Tannazbanu" and not 'Tehminabai' as written out by Mrs. Master-Moos on pages (iv) and (viii) of her book! The chart at the end of the book is inexact and at several points incorrect. Events in Ruvan's evolution after death are described wrongly at several points. I would request Mrs. Moos to see the charts in Dr. Chiniwalla's 'Tir Yashta' and his articles on Journey after death in Parsi Avaz - December 1972 onwards).

I will now say a few words on **the other contents of the trunk**. I have examined them thoroughly. **Please rest assured there are NO SECRET WRITINGS whatsoever in it.** Most of the contents are already published in Frasho-Gard Journal and by booklets The handwritings are not all the same as in the note-books on 'Sarosh' and 'Jirum'. Some are of Phiroze Masani, some of Dinshah Masani, some of the late Ervad Rustomji (Bapaji) Dastoor Meherjirana (who was my uncle and was at one time in close touch with Baheramshahji) and some of others, - the then enthusiasts of Khshnoom. The rough notes taken in the study classes organized by Mr. Choksi are also there in the trunk. **There are several notebooks in Phiroze Masani's handwritings!** All the notebooks and papers in the trunk contain the elements of the elements of Khshnoom. They were written at the time when Khshnoom movement had just started. Some of them carry the dates 1911 onwards. Care was taken at that time not to divulge that many of the Mystic Truths which would cause indigestion. The advanced truths were revealed later on step-by-step through Phiroze Masani and Dr. Faramroze Chiniwalla. The secret-dictation theory of Mrs. Master-Moos is a myth, born of over enthusiasm, and carelessness in finding out the truth.

I have written this, with a heavy heart, to clear the fog the book tries to build around the old stalwarts - Masani and Chiniwalla brothers. It was Phiroze Masani who took great pains in preparing these lectures sitting at the feet of Baheramshahji. The trunk itself contains a number of notebooks in his own handwritings and that too on Jirum itself! When a quarter of a century after his death, Mrs. Master-Moos brings up her secret-dictation theory which tries to throw to dogs all the toils and troubles taken by that genius Phiroze and says this was 'hidden' from him, I cannot sit silent. I am sorry. And the most surprising part is that Mr. Hormusji Suntoke, who boasts of his great contact with Ervad Phiroze, is a party to spreading this myth! "Azoori Pandi", Mr. Suntoke!

For old Khshnoomists I may add: this is "Hasham Versus Ham mithra"; and "મત્તા જાણી".

Finally, I may inform you that the Law of Jirum as explained by Baheramshahji and written out by Phiroze in these 11 lectures, is further elaborated by Dr. Faramroze Chiniwalla in his 'વટલાવવાના સવાલ બાબે વાદવિવાદ' These lectures and then Dr. Chiniwalla's book will give a careful reader a reasonably good grasp on this difficult chapter of Zoroastrian Mysticism. But

please do not rely on the English materials given in Mrs. Moos's book. They are, sorry to say, inexact and incorrect at several places.

May Ahura Mazda impart good sense to all!

- K. N. Dastoor.

PRIDE.....

**Dust are our frames, and gilded dust our pride
Looks only for a moment whole and sound.**

-Tennyson

.....AND HUMILITY

**Whosoever shall exalt himself shall be abased; and
he that shall humble himself shall be exalted.**

-St. Mathew 23: 12